The Math Gender Gap: The Role of Culture

Natalia Nollenberger, Nuria Rodriguez-Planas, Almudena Sevilla

Online Appendix

Table A. 1. Sample Size by Country of Ancestry and Destiny

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>ARG</th>
<th>AUS</th>
<th>AUT</th>
<th>BEL</th>
<th>CHE</th>
<th>LUX</th>
<th>NLD</th>
<th>NZL</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Albania</td>
<td>132</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Australia</td>
<td></td>
<td>36</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Austria</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>46</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Belgium</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>159</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Bolivia</td>
<td>131</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Chile</td>
<td>24</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>China</td>
<td>410</td>
<td>27</td>
<td></td>
<td>130</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>567</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Croatia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>77</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td></td>
<td>151</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Fiji</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>35</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>France</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>203</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>242</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>614</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>176</td>
<td>116</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>392</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Greece</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>46</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>158</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>88</td>
<td></td>
<td>739</td>
<td>256</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1,083</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Korea</td>
<td>31</td>
<td></td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Malaysia</td>
<td>34</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Morocco</td>
<td></td>
<td>192</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td>50</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>New Zealand</td>
<td>376</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>376</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Paraguay</td>
<td>63</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>240</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Poland</td>
<td>47</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Portugal</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>777</td>
<td>2,069</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2,846</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Romania</td>
<td>58</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>491</td>
<td>491</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Russian Fed.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>491</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>491</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Viet Nam</td>
<td>291</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>South Africa</td>
<td>60</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>246</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Suriname</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>107</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>509</td>
<td>440</td>
<td>591</td>
<td>222</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1,762</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Macedonia</td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>United</td>
<td>651</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>168</td>
<td>819</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>82</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Uruguay</td>
<td>17</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>235</td>
<td>2,435</td>
<td>749</td>
<td>633</td>
<td>2,910</td>
<td>791</td>
<td>2,842</td>
<td>548</td>
<td>384</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes: Final sample of second-generation immigrants from 2003, 2006, 2009 and 2012 PISA datasets. ARG=Argentina, AUS=Australia, AUT=Austria, BEL=Belgium, CHE=Switzerland, ISR=Israel, LUX=Luxembourg, NLD=Netherlands, NZL=New Zealand.
### Table A.2. Gender Gap in Math Scores and Gender Equality by Country of Ancestry

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country of ancestry</th>
<th>Math Gender Gap</th>
<th>GGI</th>
<th>N</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Korea</td>
<td>-78.24</td>
<td>0.61</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Macedonia</td>
<td>-72.64</td>
<td>0.69</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Uruguay</td>
<td>-40.31</td>
<td>0.69</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Fiji</td>
<td>-38.99</td>
<td>0.64</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Greece</td>
<td>-35.53</td>
<td>0.67</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Malaysia</td>
<td>-35.19</td>
<td>0.65</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 United States</td>
<td>-34.75</td>
<td>0.72</td>
<td>819</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Croatia</td>
<td>-31.74</td>
<td>0.69</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 Morocco</td>
<td>-31.70</td>
<td>0.59</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Romania</td>
<td>-30.52</td>
<td>0.68</td>
<td>491</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 Spain</td>
<td>-25.55</td>
<td>0.73</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 UK</td>
<td>-23.73</td>
<td>0.74</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 Italy</td>
<td>-22.65</td>
<td>0.68</td>
<td>1,083</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 China</td>
<td>-21.69</td>
<td>0.69</td>
<td>567</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15 Albania</td>
<td>-21.16</td>
<td>0.66</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 Poland</td>
<td>-20.11</td>
<td>0.70</td>
<td>2,846</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17 Russian Fed.</td>
<td>-16.88</td>
<td>0.70</td>
<td>291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 India</td>
<td>-16.45</td>
<td>0.62</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19 Belgium</td>
<td>-15.56</td>
<td>0.72</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 Bolivia</td>
<td>-14.36</td>
<td>0.67</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21 Turkey</td>
<td>-13.77</td>
<td>0.58</td>
<td>1,762</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22 Ethiopia</td>
<td>-10.69</td>
<td>0.59</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23 Suriname</td>
<td>-10.39</td>
<td>0.67</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24 Philippines</td>
<td>-9.66</td>
<td>0.76</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25 South Africa</td>
<td>-9.56</td>
<td>0.77</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26 Portugal</td>
<td>-8.53</td>
<td>0.70</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27 Germany</td>
<td>-6.96</td>
<td>0.74</td>
<td>392</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28 France</td>
<td>-6.43</td>
<td>0.73</td>
<td>614</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29 Viet Nam</td>
<td>-6.34</td>
<td>0.68</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30 New Zealand</td>
<td>2.42</td>
<td>0.79</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31 Paraguay</td>
<td>12.61</td>
<td>0.69</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32 Australia</td>
<td>32.26</td>
<td>0.73</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33 Austria</td>
<td>32.29</td>
<td>0.70</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34 Chile</td>
<td>33.52</td>
<td>0.69</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35 Netherlands</td>
<td>47.53</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td>376</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>-15.70</td>
<td>0.69</td>
<td>11,527</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St. Dev.</td>
<td>26.04</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Notes:** Table A.1 displays the means of the math gender gap and the GGI by country of ancestry estimated using our sample of second-generation immigrants from 2003, 2006, 2009 and 2012 PISA. Countries are ordered by the gender gap in math scores. It was obtained from estimating a linear regression using the plausible values provided by the PISA data sets as LHS variable and a female indicator as RHS (we estimated one regression for each PV and present the average of the 5 coefficients estimated). See Appendix Table A.3 for details about gender equality measures. The last two rows of Table A.1 display the mean and cross-country standard deviation.
Table A. 3. Individual-level variables: Definition and Descriptive Statistics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Definition</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>St. Dev. across countries of ancestry</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>A. Individual Characteristics</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Dummy variable equal to 1 if the individual is a girl</td>
<td>0.52</td>
<td>0.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>Years and months</td>
<td>15.77</td>
<td>0.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Different grade</td>
<td>Dummy equal to 1 if the current individual’s grade is different from the modal grade at the children age in the host country and 0 otherwise.</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td>0.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>B. Family characteristics</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mother highest level of education (MISCED)</td>
<td>Index constructed by the PISA program based upon the highest education level of each parent. It has the following categories: (0) None; (1) ISCED 1 (primary education); (2) ISCED 2 (lower secondary); (3) ISCED Level 3B or 3C (vocational/pre-vocational upper-secondary); (4) ISCED 3A (upper-secondary) and/or ISCED 4 (non-tertiary post-secondary); (5) ISCED 5B (vocational tertiary); and (6) ISCED 5A, 6 (theoretically-oriented tertiary and post-graduate).</td>
<td>3.66</td>
<td>1.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Father highest level of education (FISCED)</td>
<td></td>
<td>3.85</td>
<td>0.85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mother works</td>
<td>Dummy equal to one if the mother (father) works, and zero otherwise. Due to the direct question about parents’ labor status is not included in all PISA waves, we use students’ responses about what is the mother (father) main work. The dummy takes the value of zero when the answer is housewife, student or social beneficiary (unemployed, retired, sickness, etc.) and one otherwise.</td>
<td>0.82</td>
<td>0.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Father works</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.93</td>
<td>0.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index of home possessions (homepos)</td>
<td>The index of home possessions comprises all items on the indices of wealth, cultural possessions and home educational resources, as well as books in the home recoded into a four-level categorical variable (0-10 books, 11-25 or 26-100 books,101-200 or 201-500 books, more than 500 books). The index of wealth is based on the students' responses on whether they had a room of their own, a link to the Internet, a dishwasher, a DVD player, and three other country-specific items; and their responses on the number of cellular phones, televisions, computers, cars and the rooms with a bath or shower. The index of cultural possessions is based on the students' responses to whether they had the following at home: classic literature, books of poetry and works of art. The index of home educational resources is based on the items measuring the existence of educational resources at home including a desk and a quiet place to study, a computer, educational software, books to help with students' school work, technical reference books and a dictionary.</td>
<td>-0.04</td>
<td>0.53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>C. School characteristics</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of girls</td>
<td>PISA index of the proportion of girls enrolled in each school derived from school principals’ responses regarding the number of girls divided by the total of girls and boys at a school.</td>
<td>0.49</td>
<td>0.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private school</td>
<td>Dummy equal to 1 if school is private and 0 otherwise.</td>
<td>0.24</td>
<td>0.18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School location</td>
<td>Dummy equal to 1 if the school is in a metropolis (one million or more inhab.) and 0 otherwise.</td>
<td>0.29</td>
<td>0.27</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table A.4. Robustness Checks

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Math scores</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Baseline</td>
<td></td>
<td>GGI×Female</td>
<td>149.55**&lt;br&gt;[62.62]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>11,527</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>R²</td>
<td>0.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Controlling for ancestry-country HDI and its interaction with female</td>
<td></td>
<td>GGI×Female</td>
<td>158.79**&lt;br&gt;[66.52]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>11,527</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>R²</td>
<td>0.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Host-country regional FE</td>
<td></td>
<td>GGI×Female</td>
<td>133.98**&lt;br&gt;[62.69]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>11,527</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>R²</td>
<td>0.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Gender equality measures from 90s</td>
<td></td>
<td>FLFP(1990)×Female</td>
<td>35.46&lt;br&gt;[31.23]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>11,527</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>R²</td>
<td>0.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Parliament seats held by women (1990-97)×Female</td>
<td>77.60*&lt;br&gt;[42.79]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>11,507</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>R²</td>
<td>0.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Adding Year FE × Female</td>
<td></td>
<td>GGI×Female</td>
<td>150.13**&lt;br&gt;[64.12]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>11,527</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>R²</td>
<td>0.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. Cluster SE at country of ancestry level</td>
<td></td>
<td>GGI×Female</td>
<td>149.55***&lt;br&gt;[45.98]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>11,527</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>R²</td>
<td>0.35</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes: Results from estimating equation 1 using alternative specifications. In panel B we replace the GDP per capita in the country of ancestry by a better proxy of the human capital level in the country of ancestry (the Human Development Index). In panel C, host-country regional fixed effects are used instead of host-country fixed effects. Panel D uses alternative measures of gender equality in the country of ancestry, measured in the 1990s. Panel E presents a more flexible specification in which PISA fixed effects are interacted with the gender indicator. Panel F presents estimates with standard errors clustered at the country of ancestry level. In all cases we use the five plausible values of math test scores provided by PISA datasets and report the average coefficient (Stata command `pv`). Except for Panel F, standard errors are adjusted following the Fay’s BRR methodology using the 80 alternative weights provided by the PISA datasets.

* p<0.1, ** p<0.05, *** p<0.01
Table A.5. Sensitivity to Sample Selection

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Math scores</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GGI×Female</td>
<td>149.55**</td>
<td>[62.62]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>11,527</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R²</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A. Dropping the most important country of ancestry (Portugal)

| GGI×Female | 144.52** | [65.15] |
| N | 8,681 | |
| R² | 0.36 | |

B. Dropping the most important host country (Switzerland)

| GGI×Female | 148.77** | [74.20] |
| N | 8,617 | |
| R² | 0.38 | |

C. Keeping only one host country

| Switzerland | 163.12 | [136.34] |
| N | 2910 | |
| R² | 0.13 | |

| Australia | 199.01** | [91.00] |
| N | 2,450 | |
| R² | 0.16 | |

D. Dropping those countries that send immigrants to only one host country

| GGI×Female | 228.01** | [101.93] |
| N | 8,240 | |
| R² | 0.29 | |

Notes: Results from estimating our preferred specification (Baseline) with different samples. In panel A we drop those second-generation immigrants whose ancestries come from Portugal (the country of origin with more observations in our sample). In panel B, we drop the host country with more observations in our sample (Switzerland). In panel C, we replicate our analysis using only one host country (Switzerland or Australia). In panel D, we drop those countries that send immigrants to only one host country. In all cases we use the five plausible values of math test scores provided by PISA datasets and report the average coefficient (Stata command pv). Standard Errors are adjusted following the Fay’s BRR methodology using the 80 alternative weights provided by the PISA datasets.

* p<0.1, ** p<0.05, *** p<0.01